



City of Oregon City

625 Center Street
Oregon City, OR 97045
503-657-0891

Meeting Minutes

Historic Review Board

Tuesday, November 22, 2016

6:00 PM

Commission Chambers

1. Call to Order

Chair Metson called the meeting to order at 6:18 pm

Present: 4 - Ken Basinger, Jonathan Stone, Derek Metson and Robert Siewert

Absent: 1 - Claire Met

Staffers: 3 - Christina Robertson-Gardiner, Trevor Martin, and Laura Terway

2. Interviews

PC-16-115 HR 16-115 Historic Review Board Interviews

Two positions are open on the HRB: the Canemah Neighborhood position and the architect position. Applications were received from Grant Blythe, Howard Post, Paul Edgar, and Tochihiro Tama. Two of the four applicants were in attendance. No applications for the architect position were received. The HRB interviewed the following candidates:

- *Howard Post*
- *Paul Edgar*

The following was a list of questions asked of each candidate:

- 1. Why are you applying for a position on the Historic Review Board?*
- 2. What is your background in historic preservation?*
- 3. Have you served on other boards and commissions and if so, what did you find the most rewarding while serving?*
- 4. How would you approach a contentious issue?*
- 5. What do you feel is the role of the HRB in relation to the neighborhood associations?*
- 6. Is there a way to balance the direction of an HRB and neighborhood associations?*

Trevor Martin explained the selection process to the board members.

3. Break

The Board took a dinner break after completing the interviews.

4. Preservation Grants

PC-16-117 PG 16-03 Review a Proposed Grant for Porch and Window Repair at 512 6th Street.

Trevor Martin, Planner, provided the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to replace an existing porch and windowsill on a historic structure and replace it with a compatible wood porch and windowsill. The applicant has received bids for the proposed project and has chosen to

proceed with the offer from Framing Force Inc. the applicant feels Framing Force Inc. has notable experience with historic properties and will be able to sufficiently replicate the existing porch. Staff agrees with the applicant's decision to proceed with Framing Force Inc., pending submitted additional examples of projects Framing Force Inc. has completed on other historic structures.

Cori Woods, homeowner, provided his selection process of choosing the contractor.

Mr. Baysinger asked the current budget amount for the preservation program. Christina Robertson-Gardiner, Senior Planner, indicated there was \$2000 available under the current budget.

Motion made by Mr. Baysinger, seconded by Mr. Siewert, to approve PG 16-03, a proposed grant for porch and window repair at 512 6th Street. The motion passed with the following vote:

Voting Yea: 4 - Ken Basinger, Jonathan Stone, Derek Metson and Robert Siewert

5. Design Advice

PC-16-114 Design Advice - Canemah Cottages- Miller Street

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner introduced the item. The applicant is pursuing a cottage housing design on a vacant lot in the Canemah National Register District. Cottage housing is a permitted use in the R6 zone and is processed as a Type II Administrative Site Plan and Design Review. The site is located in the Geologic Hazards Overlay District and has a state identified wetland that was not previously identified in the Natural Resource Overlay District. The applicant is working with the Department of State Lands to provide protection for the wetland.

Chris Staggs, applicant, provided additional background on the home designs on the site and their efforts to have the homes blend in with the neighborhood.

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner commented that much of the designs are non-conforming with the Canemah guidelines and the burden is on the applicant to make the case for variance.

Clint Goodwin and Victoria Goodwin, residents of Canemah, live adjacent to this site and felt the density is not in line with the feel of Canemah and felt there will be significant traffic impacts. Mr. Goodwin noted that there are non-splitable lots with multiple homes. Mr. Goodwin noted several items that appeared to be in violation of construction guidelines and that the site has a lower elevation, subject to flooding and landslides.

Paul Edgar, resident of Canemah, felt the density of the buildings, the designs, and the retaining walls would be a violation of the Canemah design guidelines. Mr. Edgar also discussed a setback from the adjacent wetland area and its protection.

Ron Bistline, resident of Canemah and representing the Canemah neighborhood provided public comment. The development was initially a surprise to the Canemah Neighborhood Association, but the developer did conduct a presentation for the neighborhood association. Residents had the impression there were plans to build five homes on the four lots. Speaking for himself, Mr. Bistline discussed that the building appeared too close together, parking issues, and water retention.

Mr. Siewert felt much of the designs presented will ultimately require variances to be allowable, as well as other issues that are out of the purview of the HRB.

Mr. Metson led discussion on variances on historic guidelines and additional clarifications by Ms. Robertson-Gardiner on the approval process.

Mr. Baysinger commented on some of the design elements that were not in keeping with the guidelines, including building window, site grading, and parking.

Mr. Stone felt cottage housing was a departure for the neighborhood and that much of the design elements were not in keeping with the guidelines. Mr. Stone identified that the cutout of the roof, siting, projecting columnless porch covers, and asymmetric elements did not appear compatible.

Mr. Metson felt that much of the site designs were very well done but there were elements that would never meet approval by the HRB. The applicant will need to provide existing examples of designs and styles to make the case for variances to the guidelines. Mr. Metson discussed several elements that would require additional justification to achieve approval.

Mr. Stone asked if a departure to the historic style of Canemah was something they would consider. The board had discussion on this point and that the board had previously approved designs because they met the guideline criteria but were not perhaps the best fit for the area.

6. Hearings

PC-16-116 HR 16-02 – Construction of a New Single-Family Residence in the Canemah National Register District - 4th Avenue

Chair Metson opened the public hearing and read the disclosure statements. The Board did not describe any conflicts of interest or indicate any ex parte contacts. Mr. Metson, Mr. Baysinger, Mr. Stone, and Mr. Siewert had visited the site.

Ms. Robertson-Gardner discussed that the applicant is proposing a new single-family residence in the Canemah National Register District. Staff has prepared an initial memo outlining revised items and will provide a full staff report at the January 24, 2016 HRB meeting. The applicant requested preliminary design advice at the October 25, 2016 Meeting. Based on the HRB's direction, the applicant revised the plans and submitted them to staff on November 14, 2016, which include a larger distance between the garage and the home, moved the homesite on the lot, and lowered the elevation about 1 foot in overall height to reduce the visible mass.

Ms. Robertson-Gardner discussed that the application included a breezeway and suggested discussing this breezeway in relation to the breezeway rejected in HR 16-06 at the September 27, 2016 meeting.

David Greene, the applicant, provided information on changes to the prior design and efforts to eliminate the massing from the rear of the structure. Mr. Metson commented that he appreciated Mr. Greene's revised design. Mr. Metson asked how much fill dirt Mr. Greene was removing from the site and Mr. Greene indicated all the fill would be removed. There is a 67% slope on the site below the home. There was discussion of the grade of the homesite itself.

Angela Tremble, resident of Canemah, provided comment on concerns regarding landslide potential. Mr. Metson commented that although the HRB has no jurisdiction on that aspect, he assured Ms. Tremble that there will be a thorough geo-tech assessment of the potential site.

Paul Edgar, Resident of Canemah, commented on the landslide potential and discussed some of the design elements. Mr. Edgar noted that the that bulk and mass is greater than guidelines allow and the home should only have one porch.

Mr. Greene provided rebuttal. Mr. Greene verbally agreed to waive the 120-day land use decision deadline to allow the consideration of HR 16-02 to be continued to March 1, 2017. Mr. Greene felt the design could not be made much smaller to minimize the mass.

Mr. Metson asked Mr. Greene to discuss the rationale for selecting the window sizes. Mr. Greene indicated that the designer had oversized one window above the front porch, but the Coburn House had a similar window. Mr. Greene stated the other windows attempted to follow the guidelines.

Mr. Greene discussed the sightlines represented on the site plan the issues presented with terracing soil around the foundation. Mr. Greene believed that terracing or changing the slope around the foundation could create hazards.

Mr. Baysinger asked how close the home is to the neighboring house. There was discussion on placing vegetative screening adjacent to the property line.

Mr. Metson asked Mr. Greene to describe why he felt the breezeway was appropriate. Mr. Greene described it would be historically accurate to not place the bedrooms under the garage and it was a solution to build a three-bedroom house and minimize the footprint.

Mr. Metson asked Mr. Greene to have the designer confirm some of the elevations depicted in the site plans, since some inaccuracies may exist that show the home being about five feet above the correct elevation. Mr. Metson asked for these to be clarified before the next meeting.

Motion made by Mr. Baysinger, seconded by Mr. Siewert, to continue the consideration of HR 16-02 until the January 2017 meeting. The motion passed with the following vote:

Voting Yea: 4 - Ken Basinger, Jonathan Stone, Derek Metson and Robert Siewert

PC-16-118 HR 16- 07 Side and front addition of a locally designated Landmark located outside of an historic district at 16430 Hiram Avenue

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner provided the staff report. The property owner continues to work with City staff on their proposal, and has been working to keep the scope of the project smaller to remain at the staff approval level.

Motion made by Mr. Stone and seconded by Mr. Baysinger to continue consideration of HR 16-07 to the January 2017 meeting. The motion passed with the following vote:

Voting Yea: 4 - Ken Basinger, Jonathan Stone, Derek Metson and Robert Siewert

4. Communications

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner introduced Trevor Martin the new preservation planner. Interviews will be held in December 2016 and/or January 2017. Ms. Robertson-Gardiner thanked Mr. Siewert for his service on the HRB.

5. Adjournment

Chair Metson adjourned the meeting at 8:16 PM.